District: Town of Scituate
School Name: Gates Intermediate School
Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
Date: July 23, 2014

Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Town of Scituate, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design to construct a new co-located middle school connected to the existing Scituate High School to serve grades 6-8. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District's preferred solution.

District Information	
District Name	Town of Scituate
Elementary School(s)	Cushing Elementary School (K-6) Hatherly Elementary School (K-6) Jenkins Elementary School (K-6) Wampatuck Elementary School (K-6)
Middle School(s)	Gates Intermediate School (7-8)
High School(s)	Scituate High School (PK, 9-12)
Priority School Name	Gates Intermediate School
Type of School	Intermediate School
Grades Served	7-8
Year Opened	1917
Existing Square Footage	102,000
Additions/Renovations	1930: Two additional wings were added to house six new classrooms and an assembly hall 1954: Construction to the school's new A-wing including a library, two laboratories, two science rooms, two home economic rooms, two classrooms, an art room, mechanical drawing room, photo dark room, shop, gymnasium, locker rooms, medical suite, four conference rooms, and several storage rooms 1959: C-wing was added 2007: Partial roof replacement and partial exterior masonry/cupola restoration
Acreage of Site	11 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: – Mechanical, Electrical, and Plumbing systems – Building Envelope – Roofing and Windows *(that were not repaired/replaced in 2007 project)* – Life Safety and Accessibility – Communications Infrastructure In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program.
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2013-2014 Enrollment	507

District Information	
Agreed Upon Enrollment	Study Enrollment includes the following configurations: 710 students (grade configuration 6-8) (*Preferred Solution*) 465 students (grade configuration 7-8)
Enrollment Specifics	Contingent upon the Board's approval of the preferred solution, the District will sign a Design Enrollment Certification for 710 students in grades 6-8.

MSBA Board Votes	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	November 14, 2012
Invitation to Feasibility Study	June 5, 2013
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On July 30, 2014 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on November 19, 2014
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate *(Incentives points are not applicable)*	40.68%

Consultants	
Owner's Project Manager	Daedalus Projects, Inc.
Designer	Dore & Whittier Architects, Inc.

Discussion

The existing Gates Intermediate School is a 102,000 square foot building originally built in 1917 with additions in 1930, 1954, and 1959. There was also a partial roof replacement and partial exterior masonry/cupola restoration project in 2007. The existing facility is located on an 11 acre site on First Parish Road in Scituate and currently serves grades 7-8.

The District identified and the Feasibility Study confirmed numerous deficiencies in the following areas: structural integrity; mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems; building envelope and windows; roofing; life safety; and accessibility. In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program and that many existing spaces are undersized.

In addition to the physical conditions of the existing facility, two historic structures currently occupy the existing site which creates considerable site constraint issues.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. The District also performed a simultaneous assessment and evaluation of a possible grade reconfiguration based on the District's desire to pursue a three-grade educational model. Subsequently, the District voted in favor of reconfiguring the District's Middle School grade configuration from 7-8 to 6-8. Prior to the conclusion of the grade configuration assessment, the District and its consultants initially considered seventeen (17) options, including code upgrades, addition/renovation, and new construction. The District also considered three site options. The 17 initial options are presented below.

Option	Description of Preliminary Options
1	Gates, grades 7-8 (repair only)
2	Gates, grades 6-8 (50/50 addition/renovation)
3	Gates, grades 6-8 (30/70 addition/renovation)
4	Gates, grades 6-8 (East addition/renovation)
5	Gates, grades 6-8 (3-story addition/renovation)
6	Gates, grades 7-8 (3-story addition/renovation)
7	Gates, grades 6-8 (new construction)
8	Gates, grades 7-8 (new construction)
9	High School site, grades 6-8 (South A: new co-located MH/HS)
10	High School site, grades 6-8 (South B: new co-located MH/HS)
11	High School site, grades 6-8 (East: new co-located MH/HS)
12	High School site, grades 6-8 (North: new co-located MH/HS)
13	High School site, grades 7-8 (North: new co-located MH/HS)
14	High School site, grades 6-8 (South: new construction)
15	High School site, grades 6-8 (North: new construction)
16	Ellis site, grades 6-8 (new construction)
17	Ellis site, grades 7-8 (new construction)

As a result of the District's desire to include 6th grade in its Middle School, options that did not include the 6th grade were not considered for further evaluation. Additionally, Gates site options ("Options 2, 4, and 5") were not considered for further evaluation based on a combination of the following: less desirable educational program aspects; complex phasing; major site reconfiguration issues, including relocation of historic structures; and zoning constraints. Existing High School site options ("Options 11, 12, 14, and 15") were not considered for further evaluation based on a combination of the following: less desirable site development configuration and building adjacencies; impact to students during construction; and site constraints, including wetland restrictions.

Upon further discussion and review, MSBA staff and the District agreed to five (5) final options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing as presented below.

Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sf)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sf)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option 3: (Gates site, 30/70 addition/reno)	148,000	24,900 $273/sf	123,100 $368/sf	$7,900,000	$60,100,00 $406/sf	$75,100,000
Option 7: (Gates site, new construction)	129,660	0 $0/sf	129,660 $361/sf	$7,100,000	$53,900,000 $416/sf	$64,400,000

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sf)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sf)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option 3: (Gates site, 30/70 addition/reno)	148,000	24,900 $273/sf	123,100 $368/sf	$7,900,000	$60,100,00 $406/sf	$75,100,000
Option 14: (HS site, new construction)	134,850	0 $0/sf	134,850 $345/sf	$6,900,000	$53,400,000 $396/sf	$66,700,000
Option 16: (Ellis site, new construction)	129,660	0 $0/sf	129,660 $352/sf	$8,000,000	$53,700,000 $414/sf	$67,100,000
Option 10: (HS site, new co-located MS/HS)***	***139,517***	***(MS) 5,640 (HS) 9,860****** $325/sf***	***124,017 $361/sf***	***$6,400,000***	***$56,200,000 $403/sf***	***$69,400,000***

** Marked up construction costs*
*** Does not include construction contingency*
******District's preferred option***
*****Square footage associated with renovations for high school programs ineligible for reimbursement*

The District has selected "Option 10," which replaces the existing Gates Intermediate School with a new middle school co-located and connected to the existing Scituate High School, as the preferred solution to proceed into Schematic Design. This option represents the District's solution to deliver its desired educational program for a three-grade middle school. The proposed solution will arrange team spaces in the District's ideal configuration to allow for collaboration between teachers and students to facilitate project-based learning. This option repurposes portions of the District's underutilized high school facility, allows for better organization of the District's team structure, and minimizes the footprint of the facilities. These benefits are not fully realized in "Option 3." Additionally, "Option 10" involves significantly fewer site constraints and offers educational and curricular opportunities that are not available in "Options 3, 7, 14, and 16," such as the use of an existing vernal pool located on the existing Scituate High School site.

The District presented its proposed project to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee ("FAS") on June 25, 2014. At that meeting, members of the FAS inquired about the training plan for transitioning to Project-Based Learning, the District's "Bring Your Own Device" policy and technology budget, the District's intention to hire a Media Specialist for the new school, and opportunities for outdoor education related to the on-site vernal pool.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, subsequent District submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found:

1) MSBA reviewed the Feasibility Study and subsequent material and finds that the options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this

study was appropriate, and the District's preferred solution is reasonable and cost-effective, and meets the needs identified by the District.

2) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.

3) The District's schematic design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the schematic design submittal prior to a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.

4) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, with the exception of variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.

5) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the MSBA will continue to work with the District to understand the scope of work and associated square footage within the existing high school in order to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate between eligible and ineligible costs. Work associated with high school programs and infrastructure, including the proposed construction of a new 750 seat auditorium, will be ineligible for reimbursement.

6) In anticipation of the existing Gates Intermediate School coming off-line as a result of the preferred solution, during the Schematic Design phase, the MSBA will determine the appropriate amount of state funding that will be recouped in conjunction with the 2007 repair and renovation project that included partial roof replacement and partial exterior masonry/cupola restoration at the Gates Intermediate School for which the Commonwealth retroactively provided grant funding to the District in 2011.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the Town of Scituate be approved to proceed into Schematic Design to construct a new co-located middle school connected to the existing Scituate High School to serve grades 6-8.