District: Town of Westborough
School Name: Sarah W. Gibbons Middle School
Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
Date: July 23, 2014

Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Town of Westborough, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design for a limited renovation and repair project at the Sarah W. Gibbons Middle School. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District's preferred solution.

District Information	
District Name	Town of Westborough
Elementary Schools	Annie E. Fales Elementary School (K-3) Elsie A. Hastings Elementary School (PK-3) J. Harding Armstrong Elementary School (K-3) Mill Pond School (4-6)
Middle School	Sarah W. Gibbons Middle School (7-8)
High School	Westborough High School (9-12)
Priority School Name	Sarah W. Gibbons Middle School
Type of School	Middle School
Grades Served	7-8
Year Opened	1956
Existing Square Footage	110,000
Additions	1996: 32,000 square foot addition containing classrooms, science labs and a library 2001: 1,000 square foot addition
Acreage of Site	20 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: – Mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems – Building envelope and windows – Roofing – Accessibility
Original Design Capacity	600
2013-2014 Enrollment	567
Agreed Upon Enrollment	550
Enrollment Specifics	The District and MSBA have mutually agreed upon a design enrollment of 550 students serving grades 7-8.

MSBA Board Votes	
Invitation to Feasibility Study	September 30, 2009
Invitation to Eligibility Period	January 25, 2012
Invitation to Feasibility Study	October 3, 2012
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On July 30, 2014 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on January 28, 2015

Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate *(Incentives points are not applicable)*	43.00%

Consultants	
Owner's Project Manager	Heery International, Inc.
Designer	Habeeb & Associates Architects, Inc.

Discussion

The existing Sarah W. Gibbons Middle School is a 110,000 square foot building located on a 20 acre site and currently serves grades 7-8. The original building was constructed in 1956.

The District's Statement of Interest ("SOI") identified numerous deficiencies in the following areas: mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems; building envelope and windows; roofing; communications infrastructure; handicap accessibility; and lack of a fire suppression system. The District has not identified overcrowding or undersized spaces as a detriment to the delivery of its educational program, but rather attributed interruption to the delivery of its program to aging and/or failing systems infrastructure. For this reason, the scope of work for this project does not include significant layout adjustments, the need for additional square footage, or an in-depth review of the District's current educational program.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions. Based on the findings of that effort, the District considered three (3) potential options that include code upgrades, infrastructure repairs, interior renovations, and site circulation improvements. The following is a detailed list of the alternatives considered.

Option	**Description of Preliminary Options**
1	Code upgrades
2	Code upgrades and infrastructure repairs
3	Code upgrades, infrastructure repairs, limited renovations, and site circulation improvements

Given the limited scope of this renovation and repair project, the District further evaluated all three preliminary options in an effort to determine the District's preferred solution. Below is a summary of preliminary design pricing along with the final evaluation and development of options.

Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options

Option (Description)	**Total Gross Square Feet**	**Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf)**	**Square Feet of New Const. (cost*/sf)**	**Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost***	**Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sf)**	**Estimated Total Project Costs**
Option 1: Code Upgrades	110,000	110,000 $67/sf	n/a	$434,950	$7,832,450 $71/sf	$9,000,194

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf)	Square Feet of New Const. (cost*/sf)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sf)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option 2: Code Upgrades and Infrastructure Repairs	110,000	110,000 $114/sf	n/a	$434,950	$13,040,950 $118/sf	$15,995,556
Option 3: (Code Upgrades, Infrastructure Repairs, Limited Renovations, and Site Circulation Improvements)***	***110,000***	***110,000*** ***$129/sf***	***n/a***	***$1,046,450***	***$15,337,650*** ***$139/sf***	***$18,061,946***

** Marked up construction costs*
*** Does not include construction contingency*
******District's preferred option***

The District has selected "Option 3," which proposes to provide code upgrades, infrastructure repairs, limited interior renovations, and site circulation improvements, as the preferred solution to proceed into Schematic Design. The District selected "Option 3" as its preferred solution because this option achieves the District's desired level of renovation and repair required to continue to deliver its educational program in an efficient and safe environment, while extending the life of the existing facility. When compared to "Option 1" and "Option 2," "Option 3" is estimated at a higher cost based on a more comprehensive scope that better meets the District's educational objectives.

The District presented its proposed project to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee ("FAS") on June 25, 2014. At that meeting, members of the FAS raised concerns regarding: (1) opportunities to further demonstrate site circulation improvements, (2) development of a detailed construction phasing plan to be provided with the Schematic Design submittal, and (3) opportunities to further demonstrate security features in the administration area.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, subsequent District submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found:

1) MSBA reviewed the Feasibility Study and finds that the options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District's preferred solution is reasonable, cost-effective, and meets the needs identified by the District.

2) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.

3) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the MSBA will continue to work with the District to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs, specifically with respect to proposed work in the auditorium and proposed site circulation improvements.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the Town of Westborough be approved to proceed into Schematic Design for a limited renovation and repair project at the Sarah W. Gibbons Middle School.